Effective Field Theory in CMS and ATLAS







Saptaparna Bhattacharya Northwestern University



Effective Field Theories







Effective Field Theories



Complementary to BSM searches





Instead of bump hunting, looking for new physics in the tails of distributions



https://arxiv.org/pdf/ 1205.4231.pdf

$$\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_{SM} + \sum_{i} \frac{c_i}{\lambda^2} \mathcal{O}_i + \sum_{j} \frac{f_j}{\lambda^4} \mathcal{O}_j + \cdots$$

• Requirements:

- Any extension of the Standard Model (SM) should satisfy the S-matrix axioms of unitarity
- Symmetries of the SM should be respected
- The SM should be recoverable in the appropriate limit
- It should be possible to compute radiative corrections at any order in the extended theory and the SM interactions with this theory

Achieved with effective Quantum Field Theory





$$\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_{SM} + \sum_{i} \frac{c_i}{\lambda^2} \mathcal{O}_i + \sum_{j} \frac{f_j}{\lambda^4} \mathcal{O}_j + \cdots$$

• <u>CP conserving trilinear operators are of the form:</u>

 $\mathcal{O}_{WWW} = \text{Tr}[W_{\mu\nu}W^{\nu\rho}W^{\mu}_{\rho}] \qquad \mathcal{O}_B = (\mathcal{D}_{\mu}\Phi)^{\dagger}B^{\mu\nu}(\mathcal{D}_{\nu}\Phi) \qquad \mathcal{O}_W = (\mathcal{D}_{\mu}\Phi)^{\dagger}W^{\mu\nu}(\mathcal{D}_{\nu}\Phi)$

• <u>CP conserving quartic operators are of the form:</u>

$$\mathcal{L}_{S,0} = \left[(D_{\mu} \Phi)^{\dagger} D_{\nu} \Phi \right] \times \left[(D_{\mu} \Phi)^{\dagger} D_{\nu} \Phi \right] \qquad \qquad \mathcal{L}_{M,0} = Tr \left[\hat{W}_{\mu\nu} \hat{W}^{\mu\nu} \right] \times \left[(D_{\beta} \Phi)^{\dagger} D^{\beta} \Phi \right]$$
Longitudinal operators Mixed operators

$$\mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{T},0} = Tr\left[W_{\mu\nu}W^{\mu\nu}\right] \times Tr\left[W_{\alpha\beta}W^{\alpha\beta}\right]$$

Transverse operators





SM cross section summary: CMS





SM cross section summary: ATLAS







violation

Anomalous Trilinear Couplings: W+W-



https://atlas.web.cern.ch/ Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/ PAPERS/STDM-2017-24/



 $c_{\tilde{W}}/\Lambda^2$

[-91,91]

[-76, 76]











$$\alpha \to \frac{\alpha}{(1 + \hat{s}/\Lambda_{FF}^2)^2}$$

Prevent tree-level unitarity violation by introducing form factor

<u>Use $\Lambda_{FF} = 5 \text{ TeV}$ </u>

- Boosted category more sensitive
- Complementary resolved search region

Parameter	Observed $[\text{TeV}^{-2}]$	Expected $[\text{TeV}^{-2}]$	Observed $[\text{TeV}^{-2}]$	Expected $[\text{TeV}^{-2}]$
	WV -	$ ightarrow \ell u$ jj	WV -	$ ightarrow \ell u \mathrm{J}$
c_{WWW}/Λ^2	[-5.3, 5.3]	[-6.4, 6.3]	[-3.1, 3.1]	[-3.6, 3.6]
c_B/Λ^2	[-36, 43]	[-45, 51]	[-19, 20]	[-22, 23]
c_W/Λ^2	[-6.4, 11]	[-8.7, 13]	[-5.1, 5.8]	[-6.0, 6.7]

Limit also computed at $\sqrt{s} = 13$ TeV with 13 fb-1 of data in fully leptonic final state



- Analysis geared toward finding anomalous coupling contribution to the SM
- Hadronic W/Z candidate: leading AK8 jet with $p_T > 200 \text{ GeV}$
- Tail modeled as a sum of exponentials (SM (NNLO) and aTGC)
- Invariant mass of the diboson system (M_{WZ}) >900 GeV
- Pruned mass: 65-105 GeV and N-subjettiness < 0.6



publications/SMP-18-008/





- W+jets and tt are the two main backgrounds
- tt is signal like: hadronic W can be reconstructed as an AK8 jet
- Shape of the W+jets background estimated in sideband region and tt background estimated from simulations
- Contribution from aTGC expected to show up in the tail of the distributions







 $\mathcal{O}_{WWW} = \text{Tr}[W_{\mu\nu}W^{\nu\rho}W^{\mu}_{\rho}] \qquad \mathcal{O}_{W} = (\mathcal{D}_{\mu}\Phi)^{\dagger}W^{\mu\nu}(\mathcal{D}_{\nu}\Phi) \qquad \mathcal{O}_{W} = (\mathcal{D}_{\mu}\Phi)^{\dagger}W^{\mu\nu}(\mathcal{D}_{\nu}\Phi)$

Parametrization	aTGC	Expected limit	Observed limit	Run I limit
	$c_{\rm WWW}/\Lambda^2~({\rm TeV}^{-2})$	[-1.44, 1.47]	[-1.58, 1.59]	[-2.7, 2.7]
EFT	$c_{\rm W}/\Lambda^2~({\rm TeV^{-2}})$	[-2.45, 2.08]	[-2.00, 2.65]	[-2.0, 5.7]
	$c_{\rm B}/\Lambda^2~({\rm TeV^{-2}})$	[-8.38, 8.06]	[-8.78, 8.54]	[-14, 17]

Most stringent limits placed on EFT parameters

Multiboson Workshop, Fermilab







http://cmsresults.web.cern.ch/ cms-results/publicresults/publications/ SMP-18-002/

- Reconstructed transverse mass of the WZ system used to search for aTGC
- Presence of aTGC manifests as an excess of events in the tails of the p_T^z or M_{WZ}

Parameter	95% CI (expected)	95% CI (observed)
$c_{\rm w}/\Lambda^2$	[-3.3, 2.0]	[-4.1, 1.1]
$c_{\rm www}/\Lambda^2$	[-1.8, 1.9]	[-2.0, 2.1]
$c_{\rm b}/\Lambda^2$	[-130, 170]	[-100, 160]

Anomalous Trilinear Couplings: ZZ leptonic



 $q\bar{q} \rightarrow ZZ$

 $\rightarrow ZZ$ $pp \rightarrow ZZjj$ (EWK)

SM + aTGC

= 0.0038. *f÷*

Non-ZZ background

SM + aTGC, $f_{4}^{\gamma} = 0.0038$

3000

*p*_{T.*Z*1} [GeV]

https://atlas.web.cern.ch/ Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/ PAPERS/STDM-2016-15/



Analysis geared toward exploration of anomalous neutral TGCs in $ZZ \rightarrow 4I$

10

10³

10²

10¹

10⁰

 10^{-1}

 10^{-2}

2.0

1.5

0.5∟ 0

ATLAS

Vertex forbidden in the SM



N_{xy} : coefficients associated with yields that depend on final state momenta

295 415 555

 \sqrt{s} = 13 TeV, 36.1 fb⁻¹



Anomalous Trilinear Couplings: ZZ leptonic





Multiboson Workshop, Fermilab

Saptaparna Bhattacharya



- Stringent limits set in this channel
- Sensitivity enhanced by factor of ~ 2

• Expected $[\times 10^{-3}]$

Observed $[\times 10^{-3}]$

 f_5^{γ}

[-1.3, 1.3]

[-1.2, 1.2]

 f_4^{Z}

[-1.1, 1.1]

[-1.0, 1.0]

 f_5^{Z}

[-1.1, 1.1]

[-1.0, 1.0]

 f_4^{γ}

[-1.3, 1.3]

[-1.2, 1.2]



Summary of limits on anomalous trilinear couplings





 $\frac{C_{\rm B}}{\Lambda^2}$



Anomalous Quartic Couplings



$$\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_{SM} + \sum_{i} \frac{c_i}{\lambda^2} \mathcal{O}_i + \sum_{j} \frac{f_j}{\lambda^4} \mathcal{O}_j + \cdots$$

Relevant Operators	WWWW	WWZZ	ZZZZ	ZZZγ
\mathscr{L} S,1 \mathscr{L} S,2				0
См,0 См,1 См,6 См,7				
См,2 См,3 См,4 См,5	0			
<i></i> Т,0 <i>L</i> т,1 <i>L</i> т,2				
<i>£</i> т,5 <i>£</i> т,6 <i>£</i> т,7	0			
<i>£</i> т,8 <i>£</i> т,9	0	0		

Saptaparna Bhattacharya



VBS topology to look for anomalous contributions to VV couplings



Use semi-leptonic final state to tag boosted regime



Analysis Strategy



- Use boosted topology by:
 - Requiring a Lorentz boosted V-jet (p_T > 200 GeV)
 - N-subjettiness $(\tau_2/\tau_1) < 0.55$
- Mass of V-jet lies between 65-105 GeV
- Take advantage of VBS topology by:
 - Requiring 2 ak4 jets with m_{jj} > 800 GeV
 - Large η separation (ΙΔηΙ > 4.0)



- Use VBS topology to take advantage of η separation between *W/V* and *forward jets*
- Require V-boson centrality



Background estimation



- Major backgrounds: W+jets and Z+jets
- Estimate background from signal sidebands
 - $M_v \in$ [40, 65] \cup [105, 150] GeV
 - perform maximum-likelihood fit to M_{w/zv} in data
 - Model background with parametric form: f = exp(-m/(c₀ + c₁.m))
- Analysis sets most sensitive bounds on anomalous couplings





Anomalous Quartic Couplings ZZ (fully leptonic)







https://arxiv.org/pdf/ 1708.02812.pdf

M_{zz} used to set limits on anomalous quartic couplings

Coupling	Exp. lower	Exp. upper	Obs. lower	Obs. upper	Unitarity bound
$f_{\rm T0}/\Lambda^4$	-0.53	0.51	-0.46	0.44	2.5
$f_{\mathrm{T1}}/\Lambda^4$	-0.72	0.71	-0.61	0.61	2.3
$f_{\rm T2}/\Lambda^4$	-1.4	1.4	-1.2	1.2	2.4
$f_{\rm T8}/\Lambda^4$	-0.99	0.99	-0.84	0.84	2.8
$f_{\rm T9}/\Lambda^4$	-2.1	2.1	-1.8	1.8	2.9

Multiboson Workshop, Fermilab

Saptaparna Bhattacharya

m_{zz} [GeV]



Anomalous Quartic Couplings: Zγ (Z → v⊽)



https://atlas.web.cern.ch/ Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/ PAPERS/STDM-2015-21/



Multiboson Workshop, Fermilab

Saptaparna Bhattacharya



- K-matrix unitarization based on the optical theorem (https://arxiv.org/abs/0806.4145)
- Ensures projected scattering amplitude satisfies unitary condition

$$\alpha_{4}\mathcal{L}_{4} = \alpha_{4} \operatorname{tr}[\mathbf{V}_{\mu}\mathbf{V}_{\nu}] \operatorname{tr}[\mathbf{V}^{\mu}\mathbf{V}^{\nu}],$$

$$\alpha_{5}\mathcal{L}_{5} = \alpha_{5} \operatorname{tr}[\mathbf{V}_{\mu}\mathbf{V}^{\mu}] \operatorname{tr}[\mathbf{V}_{\nu}\mathbf{V}^{\nu}],$$

 α_4

Summary of limits on anomalous quartic couplings







Summary of limits on anomalous quartic couplings







Summary of limits on anomalous quartic couplings







aQGCs in triboson final states



https://atlas.web.cern.ch/ Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/ PAPERS/STDM-2016-05/





aQGCs in triboson final states





- Optimized cuts on S_T (= sum of all objects in an event) lead to almost background free environments
- Remaining backgrounds are irreducible (no contamination from fakes)
- Use simulations to determine these backgrounds
- SM WWW is taken as a background

Anomalous coupling	Allowed range (TeV^{-4})		
	Expected	Observed	
$f_{\rm T,0}/\Lambda^4$	[-1.3, 1.3]	[-1.2, 1.2]	
$f_{\mathrm{T,1}}/\Lambda^4$	[-3.7, 3.7]	[-3.3, 3.3]	
$f_{\mathrm{T,2}}/\Lambda^4$	[-3.0, 2.9]	[-2.7, 2.6]	



Summary of aTGC analyses



Process	Salient feature	CMS or ATLAS	Center of mass energy, √s and data set	Reference
W+W ⁻ production	Uses unfolded leading lepton p⊤ to set limits on aTGCs	ATLAS	13 TeV, 36.1 fb ⁻¹	<u>https://atlas.web.cern.ch/</u> <u>Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/</u> <u>PAPERS/STDM-2017-24/</u>
WZ production	Uses p⊤ of 2 resolved jets or p⊤ of boosted jet	ATLAS	8 TeV, 20.1 fb ⁻¹	<u>https://atlas.web.cern.ch/</u> <u>Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/</u> <u>PAPERS/STDM-2015-23/</u>
WZ production (semileptonic decay)	Uses mass of WV system	CMS	13 TeV, 35.9 fb ⁻¹	<u>http://cms-</u> <u>results.web.cern.ch/cms-</u> <u>results/public-results/</u> publications/SMP-18-008/
WZ production (leptonic decay)	Uses mass of WV system	CMS	13 TeV, 35.9 fb ⁻¹	<u>http://cms-</u> <u>results.web.cern.ch/cms-</u> <u>results/public-results/</u> publications/SMP-18-002/



Summary of aTGC analyses



Process	Salient feature	CMS or ATLAS	Center of mass energy, √s and data set	Reference
ZZ production	Exploration of neutral aTGCs from dim-8 operators	ATLAS	13 TeV, 36.1 fb ⁻¹	<u>https://atlas.web.cern.ch/</u> <u>Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/</u> <u>PAPERS/STDM-2016-15/</u>
ZZ (Z → I+I-, Z → VV)	Exploration of neutral aTGCs from dim-8 operators; achieve higher sensitivity	ATLAS	13 TeV, 36.1 fb ⁻¹	<u>https://atlas.web.cern.ch/</u> <u>Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/</u> <u>PAPERS/STDM-2017-03/</u>
Zγ (Z →vv)	Exploration of neutral aTGCs from dim-8 operators; achieve higher sensitivity	ATLAS	8 TeV, 20.1 fb ⁻¹	https://atlas.web.cern.ch/ Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/ PAPERS/STDM-2017-18/



Summary of aQGC analyses



Process	Salient feature	CMS or ATLAS	Center of mass energy, √s and	Reference
WZ (semileptonic)	Use VBS topology and tag a boosted W or Z jet; sets most stringent limits	CMS	13 TeV, 35.9 fb ⁻¹	<u>http://cms-</u> <u>results.web.cern.ch/cms-</u> <u>results/public-results/</u> publications/SMP-18-006/
WZ (leptonic)	VBS WZ in fully leptonic channel	CMS	13 TeV, 35.9 fb ⁻¹	<u>http://cms-</u> <u>results.web.cern.ch/cms-</u> <u>results/public-results/</u> publications/SMP-18-001/
ZZ (leptonic)	VBS ZZ in fully leptonic channel, set limits on f _{T8} , f _{T9}	CMS	13 TeV, 35.9 fb ⁻¹	<u>https://arxiv.org/pdf/</u> <u>1708.02812.pdf</u>
Zγ (Z →vv)	Limits characterized as a function of cut- off scale	ATLAS	8 TeV, 20.1 fb ⁻¹	<u>https://atlas.web.cern.ch/</u> <u>Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/</u> <u>PAPERS/STDM-2015-21/</u>
VBS WW	Analysis uses k-matrix unitarization to set limits on aQGCs	ATLAS	8 TeV, 20.1 fb ⁻¹	https://atlas.web.cern.ch/ Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/ PAPERS/STDM-2014-05/

Multiboson Workshop, Fermilab



Current state of combination of CMS and ATLAS results



It is the early stages in the determination of quartic couplings by the LHC experiments. It is hoped that the two collaborations, ATLAS and CMS, will agree to use at least one common set of parameters to express these limits to enable the reader to make a comparison and allow for a possible LHC combination.

emphasis mine!



Summary and next steps



- Anomalous contributions explored in myriad final states
- Exploration of anomalous contribution to SM couplings complementary to BSM searches
- In the process of analyzing full Run 2 dataset
- Stay tuned for new results!



CMS Integrated Luminosity, pp





Additional Material

Multiboson Workshop, Fermilab

Saptaparna Bhattacharya



Definitions



• Mass drop tagger used :

Soft Drop Condition:
$$\frac{\min(p_{T1}, p_{T2})}{p_{T1} + p_{T2}} > z_{\text{cut}} \left(\frac{\Delta R_{12}}{R_0}\right)^{\beta},$$

• Transverse mass of the WW system:

$$m_{WW,T} = \sqrt{\left(\mathbf{P}_{\ell_1} + \mathbf{P}_{\ell_2} + \mathbf{P}_{E_T^{\text{miss}}}\right)^2}$$

$$M(WZ)^{2} = [p(\ell_{1}) + p(\ell_{2}) + p(\ell_{3}) + p(\nu)]^{2}$$

$$m_{\rm T}({\rm WZ}) = \sqrt{\left[E_{\rm T}({\rm W}) + E_{\rm T}({\rm Z})\right]^2 - \left[\vec{p}_{\rm T}({\rm W}) + \vec{p}_{\rm T}({\rm Z})\right]^2},$$



aTGC Modeling



$$\begin{split} F_{\text{signal}}(m_{\text{WV}}) = & N_{\text{SM}} \left(e^{a_0 m_{\text{WV}}} + e^{a_{\text{corr}} m_{\text{WV}}} \right) \\ &+ \sum_{i} \left(N_{c_i,1} c_i^2 e^{a_{i,1} m_{\text{WV}}} \left(\frac{1 + \text{Erf}((m_{\text{WV}} - a_{0,i})/a_{\text{w,i}})}{2} \right) + N_{c_i,2} c_i e^{a_{i,2} m_{\text{WV}}} \right) \\ &+ \sum_{i \neq j}^{i < j} \left(N_{c_i,c_j} c_i c_j e^{a_{ij} m_{\text{WV}}} \right), \end{split}$$





Outline of the talk



• ATLAS results:

- WW: https://atlas.web.cern.ch/Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/PAPERS/STDM-2017-24/: done
- 4-lepton: https://atlas.web.cern.ch/Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/PAPERS/STDM-2017-09/
- Zy 13TeV: https://atlas.web.cern.ch/Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/PAPERS/STDM-2017-18/
- WVy: https://atlas.web.cern.ch/Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/PAPERS/STDM-2016-05/
- semileptonic WW/WZ: https://atlas.web.cern.ch/Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/PAPERS/STDM-2015-23/: almost done
- Zy: https://atlas.web.cern.ch/Atlas/GROUPS/PHYSICS/PAPERS/STDM-2015-21/
- ZZ production with two charged leptons and two neutrinos in the final state at 13 TeV
- -- ZZ cross-section measurement and aTGC limits at 13 TeV
- -- Electroweak Wjj cross section and aGC Limits at 7 and 8 TeV

Claudius' and my sources:

- https://arxiv.org/abs/1810.07698 (A Global Likelihood for Precision Constraints and Flavour Anomalies)
- http://pdg.lbl.gov/2019/reviews/rpp2018-rev-wz-quartic-couplings.pdf (pdg)
- https://www.thphys.uni-heidelberg.de/~gk_ppbsm/lib/exe/fetch.php?
- media=students:lectures:student_lecture_eft.pdf (Johannes intro)
- https://arxiv.org/pdf/1408.6207.pdf (Higgs EFT)
- https://arxiv.org/pdf/1205.4231.pdf (degrande)
- https://arxiv.org/pdf/1610.01618.pdf (Time to Go Beyond Triple-Gauge-Boson-Coupling Interpretation of W Pair Production)

— Claudius' previous talk: <u>https://indico.cern.ch/event/756370/contributions/3184515/attachments/</u> <u>1738204/2812041/HEHL.C.Krause.pdf</u>